



Peter the Great Museum of  
Anthropology and Ethnography  
(Kunstkamera),  
Russian Academy of Sciences



EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY  
at St PETERSBURG

for Anthropology and Culture

# Forum

No. 4 2008

Визуальная  
антропология??

St Petersburg

ISSN 1815-8927

- © Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences, 2006
- © European University at St Petersburg, 2006
- © University of Oxford, 2006

## FORUM FOR ANTHROPOLOGY AND CULTURE

*General Editor:*

**Albert Baiburin** (Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences/  
European University at St Petersburg)

*Editor, English-language edition:*

**Catriona Kelly** (European Humanities Research Centre/New College, University of Oxford)

*Reviews Editor:*

**Andy Byford** (Wolfson College/ European Humanities Research Centre, University of Oxford).

*Associate Editors:*

**Yuri Berezkin** (Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences/  
European University at St Petersburg)

**Yury Chistov** (Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences)

**Boris Firsov** (European University at St Petersburg)

**Sheila Fitzpatrick** (University of Chicago)

**Caroline Humphrey** (University of Cambridge)

**Marina Ilyna** (Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences)

**Konstantin Pozdniakov** (INALCO, Paris)

**David Ransel** (Indiana University)

**Sergei Shtyrkov** (Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences/  
European University at St Petersburg)

**Steve Smith** (University of Essex)

**Sergei Sokolovsky** (Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology, Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow)

**Nikolai Vakhtin** (European University at St Petersburg)

**Valentin Vydrin** (Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences)

**Faith Wigzell** (University College, London)

*Secretary to the Editorial Board:*

**Olga Boitsova**

*Editor:*

**Arkady Bliumbaum**

**Forum for Anthropology and Culture**

E-mail: [magazine@kunstkamera.ru](mailto:magazine@kunstkamera.ru)

## Contents

Editors' Foreword (Albert Baiburin, Catriona Kelly)..... 6

Note on Conventions..... 8

### Forum 5

#### 'Ethnographical Collections in the Modern Museum'

*Vladimir Arsenyev, Dmitry Baranov, Yuri Chistov, Francis Conte, Mirella Decheva, Steven Engelsman, Eija-Maija Kotilainen, Oleg Lysenko, Ripsime Pikichian, Jette Sandahl, Anna Schmid, Anna Siim, Valentina Uzunova, Germain Viatte* ..... 11

### Articles

*Alison Petch.* A Typology of Benefactors: the Relationships of Pitt Rivers and Tylor to the Pitt Rivers Museum at the University of Oxford **Нет фотографий** ..... 127

*Jane Garnett, Gervase Rosser.* Representing Spectacular Miracles **Нет фотографий** .....

### Forum 6

#### 'Fieldwork Ethics'

*Sergei Abashin, Marcus Banks, Olga Boitsova, Elena Boryak, Bruce Grant, Elza-Bair Guchinova, Vladimir Ilyin, Catriona Kelly, Zhanna Kormina, Larisa Pavlinskaya, Donald Raleigh, Brian Schwegler, Nona Shahnazarian, Alexandra Simanovskaya, Amrit Srinivasan, Zinaida Vasilieva, Viktor Voronkov*.....

### Articles

*Jane Zavisca.* Ethics in Ethnographical Fieldwork .....

#### Papers from 'Generations in Europe' (Oxford, April 2005)

*Catriona Kelly.* Introduction.....

*Ilia Utekhin.* Memories of Leningrad's Blockade: Testimonies from Two Generations.....

*Alexandra Piir.* What is a Courtyard For? Generations and the Use of Space in Backyard Leningrad .....

*Alessandro Portelli.* Generations in Genoa. July 2001 .....

*Hilary Pilkington,* 'The More They Talk about It, the More You Feel Like Doing It'. Reflections on the Discursive Production of Generational Experiences.....

#### The Russian Empire and the Steppe: An Exchange of Views

*Igor Grachev, Pavel Rykin,* A European's View of Asiatic History: A Response to Willard Sunderland. Taming the Wild Field:

Colonization and Empire on the Russian Steppe. Ithaca, NY, and London: Cornell University Press, 2004. ....

*Alexander Morrison*, What is ‘Colonisation’? An Alternative View of Taming the Wild Field. ....

### **Reviews**

*Andy Byford*, Literary Academia under Soviet Power: Mikhail Robinson. Sudby akademicheskoi elity: Otechestvennoe slavyanovedenie (1917 — nachalo 1930-x godov). Moscow: Izdatelstvo ‘Indrik’, 2004. ....

*Ilia Utekhin*, The Culture Bazaar: Birgit Beumers. Pop Culture Russia!: Media, Arts, and Lifestyle. (Series: Popular Cultures in the Contemporary World). Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 2005. ....

#### EDITORS' FOREWORD

The Editorial Board of *Forum for Anthropology and Culture* is delighted to introduce the fourth issue of the English-language version of *Antropologicheskii forum*, published by the Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography (Kunstkamera), Russian Academy of Sciences, with the support of the European University, St Petersburg, and of the European Humanities Research Centre, University of Oxford.

As in previous collections, the material comprises a selection of the Forum contributions, articles, reviews, and other publications that have appeared in our Russian editions (in this particular case, issues five and six). The issue is held together by four important themes, the first two linked to the discussion topics for the Forums. The first Forum addresses the history, present, and future of the ethnographical museum, or perhaps more accurately (given the tendency in recent years to rethink the entire concept of the 'ethnographical museum') of 'ethnographical' collections in the world of modern museums. Alongside this Forum appear articles by Alison

Petch on the work of the founders of the Pitt-Rivers Museum in Oxford, and by Jane Garnett and Gervase Rosser about the exhibition they organised on popular shrines in Genoa, which employed new kinds of display techniques.

Another theme addressed in this number is the idea of 'generations', a category that is understood differently not just by historians and social scientists, but by individuals and groups within the general disciplines of 'history', 'anthropology', 'sociology', etc. Each of the four papers included offers its own interpretation of the category 'generation' (whether more or less related to the life cycle, whether primarily constructed in discourses or by practices, whether consciously recognised or not, and so on), and each is located in a different temporal and geographical domain, from Leningrad of the 1930s and 1940s to the Russian and Italian provinces in the early twenty-first century.

Finally, an important exchange of views relating to Willard Sutherland's recent study of Russian expansion into the eastern steppes confronts the term 'colonisation' from two radically different perspectives. While Nikolai Grachev and Pavel Rykin vigorously take issue with the application of this term to pre-1917 Russian history, Alexander Morrison argues that their reluctance to use it is based on a rather hide-bound understanding of how 'colonial power' functioned in the case of Western European states expanding beyond their traditional borders. We are glad to include this discussion, which both gives space to a recent secondary study of note, and perpetuates the spirit of international dialogue that is central to the journal's identity, and which is evident also in the other reviews included, by Andy Byford of Mikhail Robinson's study of 1920s Soviet literary academia, and by Ilia Utekhin of Birgit Beumers's synthesis of modern Russian popular culture.

We hope in future issues to continue to publish such interlinked thematic blocks of material; for example, in *Forum for Anthropology and Culture* no. 5 (2008), there will be a publication of several articles on Soviet holidays and traditions by Russian and Western scholars.

As usual, we end by thanking everyone who has helped with the publication of this issue, including the institutions that have offered financial support to defray part of the costs of translation (the Humanities Division of the University of Oxford, the Modern Humanities Research Association, and New College, Oxford), our translators, particularly Edmund Griffiths, and the editorial staff, particularly Olga Boitsova and Arkady Bliumbaum.

Albert Baiburin  
Catriona Kelly  
Oxford/St Petersburg, February 2008

## Note on Conventions

Annotatory material has been slightly adapted for the benefit of readers who do not know Russian. Editorial notes are identified by [Editor]; all other notes are authorial. Transliteration is based on the British system (ya not ia, yu not iu, -sky rather than -skii in surnames and geographical terms) but with some modifications: Andrei not Andrey (ditto Sergei, Slobodskoi etc.) The soft sign has been omitted. Soft sign followed by e is transliterated -ye: Troepolye etc. Initial soft e usually E. Famous names that are not usually transliterated according to this system (Yermak, Yeltsin) are left in their familiar forms; exceptions are also made for the names of individuals who preferred or prefer their names to be transliterated in certain ways (N. S. Trubetzkoy, Marina Ilyna, Levon Abrahamian, Yuri Berezkin). Quotations from primary material are given in italics.

The names of contributors from Russia and other Slavonic countries are given in the form first name-last name, rather than name-patronymic-surname.

All authors were invited to vet the translations of their contributions; in cases where no response was received to the invitation, this has been made clear in an initial note.